

AIR FORCE
RESPONSE TO THE
REPORT OF THE FEDERAL ADVISORY
COMMITTEE
ON GENDER-INTEGRATED TRAINING

19990601
020

DTIC QUALITY INSPECTED 4

DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT A
Approved for Public Release
Distribution Unlimited

INTERNET DOCUMENT INFORMATION FORM

A . Report Title: Air Force Response to the Report of the Federal Advisory Committee on Gender-Integrated Training

B. DATE Report Downloaded From the Internet: 05/28/99

C. Report's Point of Contact: (Name, Organization, Address, Office Symbol, & Ph #): U.S Air Force
Attn: Patrick Hummel (703) 588-6114
AFCIC/SYSM, Pentagon
Washington, DC 20330

D. Currently Applicable Classification Level: Unclassified

E. Distribution Statement A: Approved for Public Release

F. The foregoing information was compiled and provided by:
DTIC-OCA, Initials: VM **Preparation Date** 05/28/99

The foregoing information should exactly correspond to the Title, Report Number, and the Date on the accompanying report document. If there are mismatches, or other questions, contact the above OCA Representative for resolution.

AIR FORCE RESPONSE TO THE REPORT OF THE FEDERAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON GENDER-INTEGRATED TRAINING

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

To assess current training programs in the Army, Navy, Air Force, and Marine Corps, the Secretary of Defense, William S. Cohen, appointed a Federal Advisory Committee on Gender-Integrated Training and Related Issues. The committee, comprised of eleven private citizens and chaired by former Senator Nancy Kassebaum Baker, reported its findings and recommendations to the Secretary of Defense in December 1997 (*Report of the Federal Advisory Committee on Gender-Integrated Training and Related Issues to the Secretary of Defense, December 17, 1997*). The committee provided thirty recommendations for the Services to evaluate and consider as ways to improve gender-integrated training. Their assessment covered the full accession cycle to include Recruiting, Basic Military Training (BMT), and Advanced Training. Also provided were findings and recommendations about permanently assigned recruiting and training personnel.

We used the Air Force training philosophy "Train Like We Fight" for assessing how our current recruiting and training policies and programs align with the views of the committee. This philosophy supports our belief that to maximize the contribution training has to readiness, we must provide a realistic and safe training environment that mirrors the same organization found in our operational units.

The Air Force is in general agreement with the committee's recommendations. In fact, we agree with most of the recommendations that apply to our Service. Of the thirty recommendations, we found that two recommendations are not applicable to Air Force programs, we agree with twenty-four others, partially agree with one, and disagree with three. Our response details the areas where improvement initiatives are in-progress as well as those areas where additional resources are needed.

The recommendations generating the most discussion center around gender separation issues: gender-separate units (flights) of assignment and gender-separate billeting in both Basic Military Training (BMT) and Advanced Training. After careful assessment, we conclude that our programs meet the intent of the report's recommendations by providing a Service-unique approach to accomplish the committee's stated goal "...to produce an effective, efficient, and ready force." The key to that force is the mission ready airman. To produce that airman, we consider it imperative to train in a gender-integrated environment on day one of BMT.

We disagree with the recommendation to have gender-separate flights of assignment. We believe the system we employ at BMT reflects operational reality: men and women must work together to accomplish the mission and this begins at BMT.

We also disagree with the recommendations to billet men and women in separate buildings at BMT and advanced training. The Air Force's current billeting system—in which men and women are assigned to separate, secure areas within one building—has extensive safeguards to ensure the safety and security of trainees, and we have no evidence that unauthorized access is a problem.

We partially agree with the recommendation to use the Delayed Entry Program (DEP) to better prepare recruits mentally and physically. Since DEP personnel are not on active duty, the Air Force cannot offer medical treatment in the event of injury. Because of this, we are against mandatory physical fitness during DEP. However, each of our recruiters have voluntary physical fitness programs available to their DEP members along with a variety of programs to mentally prepare a recruit for entry into BMT.

Two recommendations, “end split option in the Army” and “eliminate use of stress cards in the Navy,” are not applicable to the Air Force.

For all the other recommendations, the Air Force agrees and in many instances we are already doing those things the committee recommended. Those where we are not will require further study to ensure a smart implementation plan. Some of the recommendations will require significant resources to implement.

In summary, we believe the Gender-Integrated Training Report provides valuable views to improve training. The committee's recommendations, coupled with our training philosophy and experience, will strengthen the best Air Force training program in the world. We not only teach Air Force skills and core values, but also responsibility and accountability. The end product of this training is a mission ready airman prepared to contribute to his or her operational unit on day one.

**AIR FORCE RESPONSE TO THE REPORT
OF THE
FEDERAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON GENDER-INTEGRATED
TRAINING**

RECRUITING POLICY

- *Decrease emphasis on monetary incentives in advertising and public relations campaigns and emphasize more motivational themes of challenge and patriotism.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee noted that recruiting policy and operations, and the tone set in this initial contact, have influence well into the operational force. It believes the Services need to concentrate on those themes which help provide a stronger quality force in terms of patriotism and challenge and less on monetary gain. The report criticizes recruiting strategies which would encourage a "self before service" mentality, including heavy emphasis on cash bonuses, money for college, and commercial value of skills training. In the report, the committee notes that Air Force recruiting ads discuss monetary gain to a lesser extent than the other Services.

The Air Force has no TV or radio ads that discuss the monetary advantages of military service, and less than six percent of its printed products mention financial issues. Additionally, the Air Force has no loan forgiveness program and does not emphasize cash bonuses received by any career area.

However, we caution that it is important to have themes which will draw attention and cause young people to make the first contact with the recruiter. Appeals to patriotism are not enough. Our surveys tell us that recruiting themes based on continuing education and job skills training are the most effective. Focus groups and other supporting research initiatives done by a national advertising agency suggest that American youth are skeptical and do not respond well to purely patriotic themes. Since inception of the all-volunteer force, the military must compete with civilian industry to attract quality youth. This requires a competitive advertising campaign that responds to the needs of our customers, the American youth. The Air Force Recruiting Service uses extensive market research to determine the kinds of advertising and content that are most effective and economical.

Appendix A: BMT survey data

- *Link recruiter's full credit for a recruitment to the recruit's performance in basic training.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The recommendation to link a recruiter's full credit to the recruit's performance in basic training is aimed at keeping recruiters "honest" and to keep them from enlisting marginal recruits just to make their goals.

The Air Force has a strong feedback system in which Recruiting Service keeps track of each recruiter's effectiveness at recruiting personnel who graduate from BMT. Recruiting Service gives this information monthly to its recruiting squadrons who use the data to provide positive feedback and to identify recruiters who may need remedial training or other help. In addition, the percentage of recruits who graduate from BMT is a factor in recruiter incentive awards.

Air Force understands the intent of this recommendation and agrees that recruiters should be held responsible for their recruits. The Air Force system does this very effectively. Our process for accountability and motivation of recruiters is effective in recognizing the important work they perform.

- *Utilize the Delayed Entry Program (DEP) to better prepare recruits mentally and physically.*

Air Force Position: Partially Agree

The committee recommended that DEP be used more extensively to familiarize recruits with basic training, to teach service values and basic military skills, and to ensure recruits are physically fit before they arrive at basic training.

The Air Force agrees with the observation that recruits who actively participate in the DEP will be better prepared for basic training, both mentally and physically. The Air Force agrees with the committee's view that the DEP be used more extensively to familiarize recruits with basic training, to teach service values and basic military skills, and to ensure recruits are physically fit before they arrive at basic training. We are constantly working to improve in this area. For example, in addition to existing print and video products used to prepare prospective recruits for BMT, Recruiting Service has provided additional guidance that specifically outlines minimum pre-BMT physical conditioning responsibilities and standards. During monthly meetings with recruits these standards are reinforced and DEPers are provided training plans for improved physical fitness.

However, the Air Force is reluctant to fully endorse the committee's recommendation with regard to mandatory physical training because of past liability problems and resource requirements. Recruits in the DEP are not on active duty and the Air Force cannot provide medical care in the event of injury. In addition, such a program would require resources such as equipment, location, and additional personnel to conduct training, especially in the six hundred one-person recruiting offices.

Air Force believes it has a viable DEP program and, with the committee's insights, is working to make it even more effective.

- *Improve recruiter training so that recruiters provide more informed, up-to-date, and consistent information to potential recruits.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee recommended that recruiter training be improved so that recruits would receive the latest, most up-to-date information about basic training and careers.

The Air Force is actively engaged to provide recruiters with updated technology and information. To enhance the flow of current information, recruiting personnel, trainers, and managers meet quarterly in formal cross-talk sessions that are designed to communicate changes in training and recruiting programs and to quickly communicate this information to all recruiting detachments. In addressing these issues, Recruiting Service has made the Internet available to its recruiters and provided equipment for CD-ROM capability. Its Training Division is now developing programs that will let the recruiters call up the most current information on career fields, requirements for BMT, and other information necessary for the recruiting process. In addition, recruiters are encouraged to keep in regular contact with BMT. To encourage this interchange, Recruiting Service has a Recruiter Liaison function at BMT which helps to "get the word out" to its detachments. Air Force recruiting is active, progressive, and constantly seeking better methods.

- *Increase number of female recruiters.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee noted that females are underrepresented in the recruiting force. They believe that it is important that the recruit's first exposure at the recruiting station and to military life and military values include both male and female role models. It recommended increasing the number of female recruiters.

The Air Force is very successful in its efforts to recruit females. Women make up nine percent of the recruiting force but we are currently recruiting twenty-eight percent women. Also, since the Air Force has nearly six hundred one-person recruiting offices across the country, many recruits cannot be exposed to both female and male role models.

The Air Force and Recruiting Service are sensitive to the value female recruiters bring to our recruiting force and is putting a highly successful female recruiter on its "Recruit the Recruiter" team, a team of personnel who visit Air Force bases promoting recruiting duty. This action should pay great dividends in our ability to maintain and increase the number of women who volunteer to wear the Air Force recruiting badge.

- *End extended leave for basic-training graduates in the recruiter's assistant program.*

Air Force Position: Agree

In its comment on the Recruiter's Assistance Program (RAP), the committee criticized some Services for letting new basic training graduates take up to forty days of leave immediately after basic training to assist local recruiters. The committee felt that contributed to a negative effect on discipline, military bearing, and physical conditioning. It also noted that while the other Services also use RAP programs, they rely on advanced school graduates.

The Air Force does use RAP, but only with advanced school graduates and only for a maximum of ten days. After this period of time, the graduates move on to their first permanent duty stations.

Though they serve for only a short time, we believe RAP participants positively impact recruiting.

TRAINING CADRE

The training cadre in Air Education and Training Command (AETC) consists of Military Training Instructors (MTI) and Military Training Leaders (MTL). The MTI is used in Basic Military Training to conduct military training, physical training, and some academic training in addition to complete supervision of all billeting activities. The MTL is used in advanced training to conduct both military and physical training, but does not conduct any academic training. The MTL also supervises billeting activities. Both groups are an integral part of the AETC training continuum that ensures the readiness of our troops when they arrive at their operational units.

- *Improve screening of training cadre candidates prior to selection.*

Air Force Position: Agree

In observing the screening process for training cadre, the committee took exception with the other Services for lacking screening criteria or not enforcing the criteria they do have. The committee recommended psychological testing, checks of family stability, records review, and background checks, including prior disciplinary action.

Extensive quality checks are in place to screen MTI/MTL applicants and include the measures recommended by the committee. MTI/MTL duty is a voluntary, special duty assignment covered under "*Air Force Instruction (AFI) 36-2110, Assignments.*" Applicants are screened to ensure they meet requirements, which clearly exceed those required for routine assignments. The following is a list of factors considered when determining the fitness of an applicant:

- Only individuals in grades E-4 (who commit to a second enlistment) through E-9 are accepted.
- Overall performance must be rated above standard on his/her last five evaluation reports.

- The individual's current commander must:
 - Make a positive recommendation for selection.
 - Validate that there is no record of disciplinary action or financial irresponsibility.
 - Certify that the individual possesses a high degree of integrity, moral character, and standards of military appearance and conduct.

A personnel background check is conducted on every applicant. Personnel records are screened for derogatory information. Applicants also must possess a medical profile that allows them to meet the physical demands of the job. Additionally, applicants must pass a psychological profile examination, which includes a clinical interview by a psychologist, personality testing, and intellectual testing.

- *Improve training of training cadre to include more situation training and field work.*

Air Force Position: Agree

In looking at the training of the training cadre, the committee felt that such training needed to be improved in some of the other Services, and cited the Air Force MTI training program as the strongest and longest. The report recommended the other Services use the Air Force program as a model.

MTIs receive a total fourteen week program with heavy emphasis on field situation work, something the committee particularly liked. This includes three weeks of classroom instruction followed by eleven weeks of field work under the supervision of an experienced trainer. After selection, MTI candidates are instructed, tested, and evaluated by a certified MTI Instructor School faculty member. Candidates are taught the professional characteristics required of an MTI, fundamentals of instructional methodology, and perform practical instruction with trainees under the supervision of a certified MTI and MTI School faculty member. After certification, MTIs receive two hours of refresher training monthly, an annual refresher briefing on sexual harassment, and must certify semi-annually that they understand the Air Force and command directives on professional and unprofessional relationships and conduct.

MTLs currently receive one week of local training on a standardized AETC syllabus. In April of 1998, we will start sending all new MTLs to the first two weeks of the MTI school at Lackland, and the MTLs will receive annual refresher training.

- *Increase the number of training cadre.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee observed that the number of trainer to recruit staffing ratios is too low in all of the Services, contributing to a loss of morale among the training cadre and a decrease in their effectiveness. The committee recommended that the Services make a commitment to increase the number of training cadre assigned.

AETC was already addressing this issue at the time of the committee's report and has since completed new manpower standards for both MTIs and MTLs. The studies validated the need for 101 more MTI and MTL positions. AETC has put this increase in its FY00 POM, and will work to add positions in FY99.

Additionally, AETC has a team of personnel who visit CONUS bases in order to recruit highly qualified MTIs and MTLs. AETC proposes increasing the number of trips and expanding recruiting to Air Force units worldwide.

- *Increase the number of female trainers.*

Air Force Position: Agree

As with the recruiting force, the committee recommended that the Services increase the number of female trainers to serve as role models and to provide same-sex discipline in the barracks.

The Air Force agrees that role models are important in the training continuum. Currently, the female MTI core is about eighteen percent, very close to the active duty female population of seventeen percent. The Air Force is actively trying to recruit more highly qualified female trainers and the recruiting team mentioned in the previous recommendation is one way we intend to increase the number of female MTIs and MTLs.

- *Encourage volunteers by improving incentives and rewards so that a training assignment is career-enhancing.*

Air Force Position: Agree (action required)

The committee recommended the Services encourage volunteers by improving incentives, rewards, and making instructor assignments career enhancing for what the committee called a difficult and demanding job.

The Air Force agrees and will study the most effective incentives and rewards.

- *Clarify trainers' authority.*

Air Force Position: Agree (action required)

The committee found that the lines of authority for implementing training are not clear to instructors, and that instructors felt their tools were insufficient and they were lacking in authority. It suggested all Services review their programs to ensure a balance between reporting abuses and maintaining instructor authority.

Air Force reviewed its program and found that MTIs know their lines of authority but do not have enough tools to enforce them. That is, MTIs clearly know what is allowed and not allowed, however, they lack practical motivational tools to help them deal with difficult situations, tools that will be effective but will also maintain the respect and dignity of the recruits.

For this reason, BMT is chartering a multi-disciplinary team of trainers, educators, and behaviorists to identify more tools or techniques which may be used without fear of reproach.

- *Increase support-group staffing and enhance availability to recruits.*

Air Force Position: Agree (action required)

The committee found that support-group staffing requires review, having suffered cutbacks in the past. Its recommendation was to increase support-group staffing and enhance availability to recruits.

Air Force agrees with this recommendation. Staffing has been cut back for chaplain and other support personnel. An increase in chaplains would create a proactive presence in squadron training and common areas and would allow greater focus on things such as suicide awareness and intervention, and stress management. Such increased presence would not only act as an emotional safety valve for the trainees, but could also help to detect unwarranted behavior by trainers. In addition, because of support staff cut backs, instructors tell us they are performing more support staff duties such as Security Police augmentee and drivers of mobility equipment during mobility exercises. AETC will study this issue and recommend solutions.

BASIC TRAINING ORGANIZATION

- *Separate barracks for male and female recruits.*

Air Force Position: Disagree. We recognize the need for separate and secure living areas for men and women, but we disagree that this requires separate barracks.

The committee recommends billeting men and women in separate buildings while in basic military training to improve training, discipline, and unit cohesion, reduce disruption and increase security. We do agree with the ultimate objective as expressed by the committee and feel that BMT currently meets that intent to ensure a secure, cohesive living environment that supports training objectives. Men and women live in separate bays and are separated by steel doors and locks and are monitored by permanent party personnel twenty-four hours per day. We start early in BMT teaching the discipline of living and training together so problems with distraction can be corrected early. Strong, well-trained leadership and good discipline policy, not reorganizing, is

the key to producing mission ready airmen. Initial skills and the maturing process are taught before airmen are sent to operational units, not deferred. Our data shows no evidence of discipline problems as perceived by the committee. In 1997, we had less than one percent of BMT airmen who have had misconduct requiring UCMJ discipline.

In BMT, security is tight in the one thousand person living quarters with strict, but fair rules of social conduct and access control. Control rosters and identification badges limit access to the building and routine/random inspections are performed to ensure compliance. BMT leadership is actively involved to ensure trainees' security and safety, and hold the permanent party and students themselves accountable to properly manage the barracks' security programs. Security is a top priority and we continue to seek new and innovative ways, with enhanced technology, to improve.

While BMT's billeting procedures do not put male and female recruits in totally separate buildings, we believe the gender separation by floor or bays coupled with strict entry procedures, validated by the very low rate of disciplinary actions, meet the committee's objectives to ensure safety and security for our trainees.

Should billeting genders in separate buildings become necessary, we would have to activate another building. Gender separate billeting by building is less efficient than current billeting methods.

Appendix B: UCMJ Actions

Appendix C: BMT Separate Gender Billeting Costs

- *At gender-integrated training installations, organize same-gender platoons, divisions, flights, and continue gender-integrated training above this unit level.*

Air Force Position: Disagree. We recognize the committee's position on gender-integrated training, but disagree as to the level of organization. We believe gender-integrated "flights" reflect the operational reality of our service.

The committee points out that the most important unit in basic training is the operational training unit. Further, the committee observed that gender-integration at the operational level was causing confusion and lack of cohesion.

The Air Force's operational training unit is the "flight." We believe gender-integration at this level is a necessity. While we agree with the assessment that there was confusion and a perceived lack of cohesion, this was due to transitory effects associated with the recent implementation of a combined flight structure at the time the committee visited BMT. As MTIs adjust to the changes, these concerns have been greatly eliminated. We have no current evidence to support the statement that discipline is a problem with BMT's integrated flights. The disciplinary problems we encounter are minor and deal with young men and women who are still maturing and learning how to relate to each other professionally in a military environment.

Approximately forty percent of the flights are mixed gender. The total number of women trainees in each class determines the percent of mixed gender flights. Mixed gender flights spend about twenty-five percent of the training time in gender-separate training situations. Separate training, such as dormitory instruction and preparation, teaches the importance of attention to detail and evaluates the trainee's ability to follow instructions. Evening briefings held in the billeting areas re-emphasize core values, customs and courtesies, dorm guard responsibilities, and readiness.

Maturity, combined with the lessons of basic training, lay the foundation for advanced training and operational duty. BMT integrated flight training is the ideal starting point for such training because the environment is strictly controlled. Advanced training and operational units have less strict social rules, and are not the right place to begin the lessons of a professional working relationship between the genders.

Our goal is to train men and women to work together as a team toward common goals just as they will in operational units. It is the Air Force's view that minor distractions resulting from the maturing process is an acceptable price to pay for the long-term goal of producing airmen ready for the lifestyle and work of the operational military environment.

Also relevant is our trainee survey data which reflect a positive attitude toward their training. In a statistically significant survey covering 1997, at the ninety-five percent confidence level: ninety-six percent believed training to be professional and dignified, ninety-three percent said as they leave basic training they were motivated or extremely motivated to serve, and ninety-two percent rated their training as effective or extremely effective.

With over ninety-nine percent of all Air Force career fields open to both men and women, the vast majority of our operations are conducted in a gender-integrated mode.

Appendix D: Gender-separate training in the BMT curriculum

BASIC TRAINING REQUIREMENTS

- *Toughen basic training requirements, and enforce consistent standards for male and female recruits.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The focus of this recommendation is on the application of standards. The committee observed that the implementation of standards varied depending on the judgment of the trainers, and that recruits believed standards were applied unfairly, with standards being "soft" for women, since male instructors feared charges of sexual harassment.

Air Force data on graduation, recycle and attrition rates for men and women recruits indicate that standards are being fairly applied, and that women are not being given an unfair advantage. Basic training graduation requirements (i.e., academics, confidence course, field exercises, firing range, etc.) are the same for men and women with the exception of physical conditioning. The

differences in physical conditioning standards account for physiological differences while ensuring the same level of effort. Attrition data indicates that women are not being given any unfair advantage:

Attrition data FY 1997

	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>
Discharge rate	9.5%	12.6%
End of Course test failure rate	3.4%	4.7%
PC Evaluation first time fail rate	9.0%	14.0%

(Note second time PC failures for both men and women are less than one percent)

In looking at field training exercises conducted during basic training, the committee found that almost uniformly recruits were disappointed with their field training exercises and urged that they be strengthened.

BMT has already started planning for an expanded field training exercise as opposed to the current over-night exercise. The field training experience will be expanded incrementally to be part of a Warrior Week that will culminate BMT and will translate to better field readiness after operational training. This culminating event of BMT will not only introduce the recruits to the skills and attitude expected of Air Force members, but will also complete training in many of what are now unit ancillary training requirements such as chemical warfare, self-aid buddy care, and M-16 qualification.

Over eighty-five percent of a randomly sampled, statistically significant population (at the ninety-five percent confidence level) of trainees indicated that training is consistent in terms of standards and expectations. With strong leadership oversight during the entire training program and ample feedback mechanisms, the Air Force is in compliance with this recommendation. However, we will continue to reemphasize and achieve the application of consistent standards.

- *Toughen physical fitness requirements and expand instruction on nutrition and wellness.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee observed that many recruits expressed disappointment that basic training physical conditioning wasn't more extensive.

The Air Force agrees. BMT had already reviewed its physical conditioning (PC) program and was in the process of making changes. It had already instituted strength training and increased PC from three days a week to five days a week starting 18 February 1998. This includes ability groups and a second confidence course run. We recognize the importance of instilling an attitude of life-long fitness in our trainees.

In the area of nutrition and wellness training, the current Air Force program is in line with the committee's recommendation. BMT provides a four hour class on health, fitness, and nutrition.

Two hours of instruction are concerned with fitness concepts and terminology, fundamentals of exercise, components of fitness (i.e., endurance, muscular strength, flexibility, etc.), and the principles of exercise (i.e., frequency, intensity, time, and type). One hour is spent teaching recruits how to structure individual exercise programs, develop a routine, and make exercise a habit. One hour covers basic facts about nutrition to include essentials of good nutrition, explanation of the food guide pyramid, and how to develop a good dietary program.

- *End split option in the Army.*

Air Force Position: Not Applicable

The Army has a program in which reserve personnel are allowed to attend basic training before finishing high school. The Air Force has no counterpart.

- *Review attrition rates and determine whether improvements need to be made in providing more leeway to discharge recruits from the services.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee recommended that each Service review its elimination procedures from basic training and ensure there is no pressure to keep “numbers up” by keeping marginal recruits in training.

The Air Force is already doing this and attrition rate review is an ongoing process. When attrition deviates more than a few points away from the historical average, we look into the process to see if we can learn anything about the excess deviation, with the intent of making corrections.

Over a fifteen year period, BMT attrition rate average has been 7.9 percent. Yet in 1997, attrition was 9.1 percent. From this we conclude that our primary focus is on graduating those who meet standards and not driven by a quota. In addition, our follow-on training attrition is around four percent, which indicates attrition occurs in the right place.

Regarding the committee’s comments that we review procedures to determine if more leeway is needed to discharge recruits from the Service, we scrubbed our process and found that instructors have solid authority to recommend a recruit be eliminated for cause. The BMT group commander has discharge authority. Our review of the attrition rates indicates that the discharge authority is being exercised appropriately, and we are aligned with the thinking of the committee.

Appendix E: BMT Attrition rates

- *Eliminate use of “stress cards” in the Navy.*

Air Force Position: Not Applicable

The committee observed that the Stress Card was subject to misuse and recommended its elimination.

TEACHING PROFESSIONAL RELATIONSHIPS

- *Improve instruction on how males and females should relate to each other professionally; eliminate “no talk, no touch” policies.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee observed that sexual harassment training was oversimplified, relying mostly on teaching fear in the workplace as a deterrent to inappropriate activity. It also observed that the Services have instituted radical policies to avoid male/female interaction, such as “no talk, no touch” policies, which heightens the sense of fear and confusion over sexual harassment policies. It recommended such policies be eliminated and that instruction on sexual harassment be expanded to include positive instruction on how to relate professionally.

The Air Force does not have a “no talk, no touch” policy and will be sure one does not informally evolve.

The Air Force realized long ago that training is needed to teach our trainers and trainees the art of human relations. Prior to this report, the Air Force put into place appropriate instruction and feedback mechanisms to teach males and females how to relate to each other professionally. Our instructional regimen does not oversimplify sexual harassment training nor does it emphasize a “no-talk, no-touch” policy. Several training forums and related materials provide trainees with clear instruction on what sexual harassment is and how to relate to each other professionally, to include use of positive interpersonal tools. These forums and materials are:

- Trainees receive the Air Force’s pamphlet on discrimination and sexual harassment within twenty-four hours of arrival. This pamphlet is referenced during Human Relations training and is explained by the commander during the incoming brief.
- Commander’s Incoming Training (1.5 hours): the squadron commander discusses sexual harassment and professional relationships between trainees and instructors/permanent party personnel.
- Uniform Code of Military Justice (UCMJ) Orientation (3 hours): a Military Training Instructor supervisor discusses sexual offenses.
- Human Relations lesson (4 hours): an academic instructor provides descriptions and examples on discrimination, sexual harassment, professional relationships, and fraternization.
- Sexual Harassment discussion (1 hour): following the four-hour Human Relations class, trainees participate in a discussion session guided by case studies.

Similarly, prior to becoming instructors, MTI candidates receive eight hours of training dedicated to human relations/individual differences. This training covers sexual harassment policy and counseling which includes handling situations involving the opposite gender. This is in addition to four hours of equal opportunity/human relations training they receive as part of normal base orientation. Additionally, MTIs receive two hours of refresher training monthly, an annual refresher briefing on sexual harassment, and must certify semi-annually that they understand directives on professional and unprofessional relationships and conduct. MTLs receive three hours of training.

Also, several feedback mechanisms are in place to identify inappropriate behavior. These include direct trainee reporting using phone number contacts, instantaneous critiques reported directly to the BMT group commander by an independent office, and trainee surveys which provide management feedback on how training is conducted and on the professionalism of the Military Training Instructor corps. Additionally, the chaplain, the training wing inspector general, and the Air Force Sexual Harassment Hotline are also available.

Continual reinforcement and monitoring of professionals who conduct training and frequent reviews of fraternization policies occur in squadron monthly continuing education programs. Inappropriate behavior is strictly forbidden in the Air Force. Such actions are dealt with severely and promptly.

Current programs are effective and continually monitored.

- *Enforce polices to eradicate disparaging references to gender.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee noted that all of the Services have regulations prohibiting disparaging references to gender, but made the comment that not all Services were strictly enforcing these regulations. The committee observed that in those Services the training cadre is transmitting attitudes of sexual discrimination by such things as allowing their trainers to tell male recruits that they “run like a bunch of women” and that this is tolerated as being motivational. As a result, the committee recommends that the chain of command enforce regulations against gender discrimination as tightly as it enforces regulations against racial discrimination.

The Air Force does not tolerate insensitive remarks or actions with regard to race, religion, or gender, and puts strong leadership emphasis on compliance in this area. Our review indicates our procedures and policies are sound and produce meaningful results. In fact, our survey data indicate less than two percent of trainees find the language used in training to be profane or degrading. And again, there are feedback and survey mechanisms in place to detect unprofessional behavior should it arise.

Several avenues exist to enforce proper human relations conduct to include enlisting the help of trainees through awareness and critiques, compliance surveys, and the use of appropriate policies.

- Trainee Awareness and Critiques: Trainees are made aware of their rights and the importance of the chain of command in identifying and resolving any type of inappropriate behavior. Trainees are given phone numbers for the trainee's chain of command, Social Actions, Inspector General, and Air Force Hotline for the purpose of reporting improper and/or immoral behavior. The squadron commander explains reporting procedures to the trainees in the Commander's Incoming Briefing. Trainees have ready access to Instantaneous Critique Forms and drop boxes placed in various locations which allow for anonymous usage (i.e. chapel, processing points, and dining hall facility exits). Critiques are picked-up daily by an independent office which provides the critiques directly to the group commander (a colonel) for action.
- Compliance Surveys: Two surveys are administered to a statistically significant, random sample of basic trainees (to achieve a ninety-five percent confidence level) during their second and sixth weeks of training. These surveys give management insight into the human relations climate and promote follow-up as needed.
- Use of Appropriate Policies: Several policies promote "checks and balances" creating additional opportunity to enforce appropriate behavior. The practice of integrating flights promotes interaction and teamwork among instructors from separate flights, and limits the opportunity for unabated disparaging references to gender. A "Two Charge of Quarters (CQ)" policy reduces the possibility of compromising situations between permanent party and trainee personnel by requiring two permanent party personnel to be present when dealing with trainees after hours.

In sum, sufficient procedures are in place to enforce appropriate human relations conduct. Through trainee awareness measures, as well as frequent critiques and surveys, and with the use of appropriate policies, USAF Basic Military Training provides appropriate enforcement mechanisms and reduces the opportunity for inappropriate behavior.

- *Teach consistent rules of fraternization.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee observed the term "fraternization" was being used inappropriately in basic training to describe sexual misconduct between recruits and recommends it be used only in reference to the Service policies on this issue.

We reviewed our instruction and found no modifications are needed. Our training focuses on fraternization as a personal relationship between an officer and an enlisted member, which violates the customary bounds of acceptable behavior. Basic trainees receive instruction on fraternization

during a four hour block of human relations training, and operations training students receive another two hours.

- *Enforce tough punishments for false accusations regarding sexual harassment and misconduct.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee recommended the Services ensure tough punishments for false accusations regarding sexual harassment and misconduct. This recommendation is based on the goal of dampening the fear of such false accusations. Under some circumstances, making false accusations of sexual harassment or misconduct may violate the Uniform Code of Military Justice.

The Air Force does not tolerate this type of misconduct and will take appropriate disciplinary action if warranted. Commanders obviously must be sensitive to potential issues of reprisal, but when there is proof of a knowingly false accusation of sexual harassment or misconduct, we agree that they should not hesitate to take disciplinary or administrative action appropriate to the offense.

ADVANCED SCHOOL

- *Strengthen discipline continuum from basic training into advanced training in order to maintain high standards of discipline and military bearing throughout the training cycle.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee stated that for all Services, advanced school training does not receive the attention, focus, and energy that are required to complete the training cycle. The committee observed that what it called an unstructured approach to advanced school training was not only missing the opportunity to build on the values and discipline instilled in basic training, but in some cases was rolling back those accomplishments.

The Air Force, through the employment of a “Phase Program” and other initiatives prepares its trainees for transition from basic training, to advanced training, and ultimately to their first duty assignment. The Phase Program is a five-phase program, which allows airmen to incrementally gain specific privileges during advanced training. For example Phase One, the first two weeks out of basic training, is very similar to basic training in its restrictions: trainees must stay on base, have a strict curfew, remain in uniform, and are not allowed alcohol or private vehicles. If trainees satisfactorily complete this phase, they progress to Phase Two which has more liberal freedoms, and so on for the rest of the phases. By Phase Five, trainees have earned most of the same freedoms and privileges found in the operational units. This graduated approach to personal liberties maintains the discipline continuum while preparing the trainees to assume duties at their first duty stations. Privileges gained allow airmen the opportunity to mature professionally. Trainees are briefed on Air Force guidance, adverse effects of alcohol on wellness, and types of punishment (judicial and non-judicial) for violations of Air Force guidance. Use of alcohol and

sexual harassment are again briefed by MTLs during squadron in-processing and reemphasized during squadron commander/first sergeant orientation.

The NCO corps, both academic instructors and MTLs, is encouraged to mentor students throughout training to ensure they are competent members of the United States Air Force upon graduation. The programs for transition from BMT into advanced training are very thorough. First duty assignment operational supervisors ensure mentoring continues after airmen arrive at their units. The Air Force prepares its students and trainees for transitions from basic training, to advanced training, and ultimately to their first duty assignments.

Students receive one hour of training on substance abuse. The class focus is on the basic goals of the Air Force's policy and the problems associated with drug and alcohol abuse. This includes identification of substance abusers through investigation, medical care, commander referral, urinalysis, and self-identification. The class discussion centers on the responsibilities of Air Force personnel in regards to their responsibility to report drug and alcohol abuse, and to exercise good judgment in the use of alcohol.

Air Force trainees discuss rape and rape prevention for approximately one hour as part of a four hour human relations class. The class defines rape and discusses ways to avoid attack. The emphasis is placed on negotiating, verbal assertiveness, and physical resistance as preventive measures. Additionally, instruction includes the appropriate procedures to properly report rape. The class closes with the penalties set forth in the Uniform Code of Military Justice (UCMJ). The current program is being reviewed with the intention of adding case studies to improve awareness and understanding regarding issues such as "date rape."

The committee lays some of the blame for the lack of student control on low staffing ratios. We agree this is a problem in trying to enforce all programs in place. A new manpower study recommends more MTL authorizations (addressed in an earlier portion of this reply).

- *Prepare basic training graduates better for the lifestyle change in advanced school and prepare advanced school graduates better for the lifestyle change in the operational unit.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee recommended that at the transitions from basic training to advanced school and advanced school to the unit, graduates should be better prepared for the lifestyle changes and responsibilities. This should include instruction on alcohol abuse and rape awareness.

As stated above, our five-step program is geared to provide individual-centered attention. Trainees are provided guided discussion regarding alcohol and rape awareness in both BMT and advanced school. As an individual progresses in accepting responsibility for his/her own actions, the student is rewarded with increased liberties. This program of increasing liberties is intended to

prepare the trainee professionally, emotionally, and personally for the relatively unrestricted personal life in operational units.

Appendix F: Phase Program Matrix

- *Separate barracks for male and female students.*

Air Force Position: Disagree. We recognize the need for separate and secure living areas for men and women, but we disagree that this requires separate barracks.

Similar to the BMT recommendation to billet men and women in separate barracks, the committee believes the genders should be separated in advanced training. However, unlike BMT where the committee cites training disruption, the lack of cohesiveness, and discipline as supporting rationale for their recommendation, for advanced training the committee's only reported concern is discipline. In discussions with committee members, they advanced their concern by citing anecdotal issues of inadequate security, believing that men and women have uncontrolled access to each others' barracks areas.

We believe that we provide a safe, secure and disciplined living environment. Safety and security is always a primary concern, and accordingly the dorms are monitored and secured twenty-four hours a day, seven days a week by a combined team of permanent party personnel and students. Students are used during all hours and may be on their own (but have access to on-call military leaders) for a brief period in the early morning hours. They are taught the rules and policies that govern life in the barracks and then are given the responsibility to enforce these policies by being placed in charge of the quarters (CQ) duty. The students are provided oversight and guidance while carrying out these duties and are then held accountable for their actions. The CQ duty provides important lessons in responsibility, integrity and maturity, all valuable tools as the airmen graduate and transition from the training environment to their operational units.

To ensure reasonable security and safety of all barracks occupants, the CQ and military training leaders employ an array of tools, such as room inspections, security checks, door guards, access rosters, security locks, gender separate living by floor or wing, electronic security, etc. Different barracks configurations such as outside entry versus inside room entry dictate the method and security programs used by our leadership. One approach does not fit all.

The phase program (a progressive program, where students earn by performance and time, greater freedoms and responsibilities as they move through training) is an important element in maintaining discipline in the living environment. Students just arriving in advanced training are governed by a strict set of rules regarding personal and military freedoms. As students pass through timed phase points and demonstrate the level of maturity and responsibility to function in an advanced military environment, the restrictions are relaxed. By the time they graduate, their freedoms and benefits are similar to those in operational units. This phased approach reduces discipline problems associated with living in the same barracks and better prepares students to function in their operational units.

Data dealing with courts-martial and Article 15s (non-judicial punishment) provide a compelling demonstration of our success in providing a disciplined living environment. In 1997, for initial skills advanced training, there were less than one in eight hundred eighty (0.11%) students cited for student-on-student misconduct under UCMJ authority and only 0.02% of these incidents occurred in the dorm. These statistics argue that we have strong leadership and comprehensive oversight in our advanced training barracks. We believe it is valid to conclude that our policies and procedures dealing with living arrangements for men and women in advanced training provide a safe, secure, and well-disciplined living environment. We also have the added benefit of providing valuable training to our students.

In sum, we believe current billeting arrangements in advanced training are in line with our training philosophy, "Train Like We Fight", and are consistent with the committee's intent to ensure we have a secure, well disciplined living environment.

Gender-separate housing is less efficient than current billeting and would require more dorms if implemented, with attendant MILCON requirements.

Appendix G: Advanced Training Separate Gender Billeting Costs

- *Review initial entry training curricula to shift more training into IET in order to reduce the training requirements of the operational units.*

Air Force Position: Agree

Per the committee's report, supervisors in operational units told the committee that the military draw down and the high rates of deployment limit their ability to provide training to newly assigned service personnel. The committee recommended that each Service review its training curricula to see if more skills training could be shifted into formal training, called initial entry training (IET), to relieve the operational units of a training burden. IET encompasses both basic training and advanced training.

For the last two years, AETC has been implementing the mission ready technician program in which technical specialty operations training graduates are fully prepared to work at the apprentice level from their first day on the job. This program shifts significant amounts of training from the operational units into AETC. In the formal training programs of AETC, trainees are actually task certified on typical apprentice-level tasks, tasks that the operational units do not have to teach once the trainee arrives on station. It will take a few more years and appropriate resources to complete the program.

In addition, AETC is now looking at what can be done to shift some advanced training into BMT, such as self-aid buddy care, chemical warfare, COMSEC, OPSEC, etc., as part of the planned Warrior Week.

VALUES TRAINING

- *Improve values training in all initial entry training programs.*

Air Force Position: Agree

The committee recommended that the Services improve values training programs in their initial entry curricula, which includes advanced as well as basic training.

We clearly understand the intent and importance of this recommendation, and believe the Air Force has a robust core values training program which is an integral part of basic training. All trainees are issued the USAF Core Values Book immediately upon arrival. This book plays a unique part in building character and is an integral part of transforming trainees to airmen. The content of the book is referenced throughout the training curricula. Trainees attend a three-hour formal class on Air Force Core Values. The first hour is an introduction and explains definitions of core values. It is followed by two hours of active learning with a Senior Noncommissioned Officer guiding discussion using practical exercises. The emphasis on Air Force core values permeates the training continuum.

On 1 January 1997, active (interactive) learning was incorporated into basic training teaching methodology. Core values topics are given special emphasis and are “inter-woven” into every lesson plan through the use of this methodology. Methods incorporated include:

- Case studies: Trainees draw professionally relevant conclusions after collective discussion and decision making.
- Directed discussion: Trainees are invited to collectively discuss and draw conclusions about features of the ethical climate in which they live or work.
- One-way stories: The instructor relates a story and invites the trainee to draw professionally relevant conclusions.
- Two-way stories: Trainees are invited to tell and comment on a story of their own. Other trainees are then asked to comment on the storyteller’s comments.

Trainees receive a satisfactory or unsatisfactory weekly core values grade based on the whole person concept. Trainee counseling is anchored in core values. Instructors apply good judgment and experience in measuring each trainee. They consider integrity, excellence, service before self, and any other behaviors or aspects of adapting to military life. Core values are also briefed as an integral part of the daily evening briefings given by each flight’s military instructor.

For over a year, BMT has held its highly successful “Enlisted Heritage Program.” Enlisted guest speakers have included senior enlisted advisors, first sergeants, noncommissioned officers with combat experience, and former prisoners of war, who give a one-hour presentation to trainees on their personal military experiences. This program has inspired respect for war fighting airmen and

pride in the history of the Air Force. The Air Force continues to strive for improvement in this important part of our training curriculum.

TRAINING RESOURCES

- *Increase training resources to improve staffing and infrastructure.*

Air Force Position: Agree (action required)

The committee observed that not only did staffing need to be improved for training instructors and support personnel, but also that "training" should be treated as if it were a weapons system, with the same time, attention, and money spent on the preparation of its troops as on the design of guns and tanks. Since FY91, the money spent by the DoD to train a single recruit has been cut by twenty-two percent. As a result, the committee recommends that the DoD increase resources dedicated to training to improve staffing ratios and infrastructure.

We agree, and believe that training should be classified and funded as mission vice infrastructure. The Air Force views training as readiness, and all training that AETC does not do reverts to the operational commands who are not organized or equipped to handle large training loads. In addition, the high operations tempo of operational units makes it even more important that training be done as early as possible in the training continuum by AETC. Eventually, funds shortages to properly equip our training mission are bound to affect Air Force readiness.

Appendix H is a summary of estimated costs to implement all recommendations. However, some recommendations require further study to determine best implementation actions and to quantify any resources required.